Building Tolerance and Balance: A Systematic Literature Review on Religious Moderation Among Students in Higher Education

Ahmad Shofiyuddin1*, Siti Khoiriyah1, Rangga Sa’adillah2
1Universitas Nahdlatul Ulama Sunan Giri, Indonesia
2Sekolah Tinggi Agama Islam Taswirul Afkar, Indonesia
shof@unugiri.ac.id

Received: October 25, 2023
Revised: Februari 01, 2024
Accepted: March 31, 2024

Abstract

In an increasingly complex global context, religious moderation among higher education students is becoming increasingly important for promoting social harmony and intercultural dialogue. Furthermore, understanding the intricacies of religious moderation in the context of higher education is crucial for fostering a more inclusive and tolerant atmosphere among students of varying faith backgrounds. This article presents a systematic study that maps research studies on religious moderation in higher education using the Systematic Literature Review (SLR) method. The main objective of this study is to describe current research trends on religious moderation among college students and identify essential implications that can be drawn from such findings. The results of this SLR analysis revealed several key findings. First, research trends underscore the role of moderate character traits in shaping compassionate attitudes, positive thinking, strengthening religious commitment, and nurturing brotherhood among college students. Second, the research also shows that religious moderation can help minimize social conflict and create an inclusive environment on campus. Second, it also has implications in shaping students’ character and equipping them with the social skills needed in a diverse society.

Keywords: Religious Moderation, Tolerance, Implications.

1. Introduction

College is where students reflect profoundly and explore their religious beliefs and identity (Yunus et al., 2020). The religious beliefs and identities of students in college play
a central role in shaping their worldview and social interactions (Bagir et al., 2015). As they undergo critical phases of personal and intellectual development, the campus environment is often where they interact with diverse religious beliefs and seek to understand their place in a broader religious context (Nurhadi and Jasmar, 2019). Religious identity can influence the choice of values, purpose in life, and views on social and ethical issues (Andriani, 2020).

College is often where individuals with diverse religious backgrounds meet and interact (Nurhadi and Jasmar, 2019). The study of religious moderation can help understand how students with different religious beliefs coexist harmoniously and with mutual respect (Jamilah, 2021; Sari et al., 2020). Students with a moderate understanding of religion tend to be more open to dialogue and tolerant of different views (Kadi, 2022). Vice versa, when students need to understand religious moderation, they tend to limit themselves and are not readily open to dealing with the dynamics of the diversity of beliefs (Nurhadi and Jasmar, 2019; Kadi, 2022).

Recently, cases of religious moderation and intolerance in the college environment have been in the spotlight (Al Faruq and Noviani, 2021). This phenomenon includes various incidents where diverse religious views and beliefs are ignored or even faced with intolerance (Hadi and Bayu, 2021; Riyanti, 2022). Religious freedom and plurality should be the main pillars in higher education, where students and academics should be able to express opinions and views without fear or discrimination (Ridwan and Abdurrahim, 2023). These cases underscore the need for inclusive approaches and education on diversity and interfaith harmony (Chen and Tu, 2019).

A collective effort from across the college community is needed to create an environment that encourages open dialogue, is inclusive, and respects differences (Syarif, 2021) to ensure that the values of moderation and tolerance are maintained and upheld amid the education and learning process (Harmi et al., 2022). By adopting an inclusive attitude, the college can provide a space for students and staff with diverse cultural, religious, ethnic, and viewed backgrounds to participate actively in the learning process and collaborate. This enriches the learning experience and helps build social skills essential in an increasingly globalized world (Andriani, 2020; Priscilla et al., 2020).

This research review can provide insight into how religious moderation in universities can play a role in preventing extremism and conflict. Religious moderation can help students develop inclusive character, ethics, and social awareness. This study can also explain how religious moderation contributes to forming positive character and ethics among students. Students often face academic and social pressures that can impact their psychological well-being.

Similar research that has been conducted related to religious moderation in the university environment includes research (Al Faruq and Noviani, 2021) regarding religious moderation education in dealing with the seeds of radicalism in educational institutions. Research results (Wahab, 2022) discuss research trends regarding religious moderation in 2020-2022 during COVID-19. It was found that most of the research locations were in Central Java Province. Furthermore, research findings (Winoto, 2022) explained the challenges in developing a curriculum based on religious moderation in the Education environment. Furthermore, research conducted by (Mahfud et al., 2022) discusses research trends related to the relationship between moderation education, Pancasila education, and citizenship. Then, research (Kasdi, Farida, and Mahfud, 2020) examines the trend of reli-
gious moderation research studies in State Islamic Universities or PTKIN in Indonesia.

Previous research that has been presented illustrates that studies on religious moderation have often been carried out. However, problems related to radicalism, intolerance, and attitudes that cannot accept diversity in the university environment still often appear on the surface. This provides an alarm for researchers to examine research trends carried out over four years, from 2019 to 2023, related to religious moderation in the university environment, which will map the topics and themes of religious moderation research, its influence, and implications in universities.

This research aims to systematically explore and analyze the literature on religious moderation among university students, specifically focusing on fostering tolerance and balance. Employing a Systematic Literature Review (SLR) approach, this study introduces a novel theme by dissecting the intricate dynamics of student interfaith interactions. The findings illustrate that reading religious moderation can serve as a foundation for shaping more tolerant perceptions and creating equilibrium within the campus environment. The implications of this research can contribute to developing higher education strategies that promote interfaith dialogue, strengthen communal harmony, and empower students to become positive agents of change in building an inclusive and harmonious society.

Research on religious moderation can help identify ways moderate religious values can support students’ mental well-being. Students often interact with individuals from various cultural and religious backgrounds. This research can provide insight into how religious moderation can contribute to positive and meaningful intercultural learning. The results of research on religious moderation in universities can provide valuable input for developing a more inclusive religious curriculum and education, promoting a more balanced and moderate understanding of religious beliefs.

2. Methods

This research uses a Systematic Literature Review (SLR). The literature is from journals or articles relevant to religious moderation in higher education. A literature review is carried out by selecting, identifying, and evaluating research to answer Research Questions (RQ) that have been formulated. In this systematic literature review, the study began by identifying articles related to religious moderation in higher education from search engines such as ERIC, SCOPUS, and SPRINGER databases. There are four phases in literature mapping, namely, identification phase, screening phase, eligibility phase, and extraction phase. The tool used for Systematic review management is “evidence.”

2.1. Identification Phase

Determination of articles that meet the established criteria. First, the database sources used for this systematic literature review are ERIC, SCOPUS and SPRINGER. With the criteria of articles published from 2019 to 2023. Articles are identified through related keywords based on the three search engines required for reviews shown Table 1.
Table 1. Keywords used to search for relevant articles

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Database</th>
<th>Keywords</th>
<th>Total Databases</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SCOPUS</td>
<td>Religious Moderation in Higher Education</td>
<td>200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ERIC</td>
<td>Religious Moderation in Higher Education</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPRINGER</td>
<td>Religious Moderation in Higher Education</td>
<td>142</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 shows that the keyword used in finding relevant articles is Religious Moderation in Higher Education. The focus determined in this literature leads to the evaluation of tracing research trends related to Religious Moderation. There are 487 literatures from three relevant data sources related to Religious Moderation. The next stage is to determine the criteria for article inclusion and exclusion from the focused theme according to the framework required for review as shown in Table 2.

Table 2. Inclusion and exclusion criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Inclusion Criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Journal Articles</td>
<td>Book chapters, book, proceedings, review</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Related Articles Religious Moderation in Higher Education</td>
<td>Articles Not Related to Religious Moderation in Higher Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>English-language articles</td>
<td>Articles not published in English.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.2. Screening Phase

Literature results from SCOPUS, ERIC and SPRINGER databases are filtered through Zotero software to separate duplicated articles. Next is the title and abstract screening process, which is mapping articles based on titles and abstracts. The titles are filtered for having relevance and match to the keywords used. Then, the abstracts of each article are filtered and scanned according to predefined inclusion and exclusion criteria.

2.3. Eligibility Phase

At this stage, the article is analyzed and checked for feasibility through zotero software. After the article is identified as feasible, it can then download the full text of the article and separate the articles that are included in the exclusion criteria. In this phase, articles that are determined to be feasible should be able to map answers to questions in research or Research Questions.

2.4. Extraction Phase

After checking the notability of the article based on inclusion and exclusion criteria. Articles that are eligible for inclusion criteria will be extracted and analyzed according to the statement that will be used as a guideline, namely Participant, Intervention, Comparison conditions, Outcomes, Studies (PICOS). The determination of stats in the extraction process depends on the expected trend in the research question. In the data extraction process using a manual model based on PICOS stats and continued on quality studies from the extracted literature. The following is the process of searching for articles using PRISMA flow charts:
As the prism chart flows above, there are 487 databases from SCOPUS, ERIC and SPRINGER. There are 48 duplicate-identified databases. Then the rest of the databases are mapped according to inclusion and exclusion criteria. A total of 463 databases were included in the exclusion criteria because the databases were in the form of books, proceedings and did not match the keyword criteria specified in the study and did not speak English. The remaining 24 databases are articles that are included in the inclusion criteria. In the next stage, the article will be analyzed and deepened using PICOS stats that have been set in exposure to the analysis method.

3. Results and Discussion

3.1. Results

3.1.1. Article Mapping on Religious Moderation in Higher Education

From the findings of the ERIC, SCOPUS and SPRINGER databases, there are 487 databases according to the keyword "Religious Moderation in Higher Education". After the identification process through Zotero software, 24 articles were found to be included in the inclusion criteria with predetermined conditions. The mapping of 24 arti-
Articles will be explained based on author and date, Title, Publication and accredited journals that are relevant to the Research Question (RQ), namely the trend of research studies on religious moderation in universities (RQ1), Implications of research studies on religious moderation in universities (RQ2). The following is a mapping table of articles that fall under the inclusion criteria:

As the prism chart flows above, there are 487 data from SCOPUS, ERIC, and SPRINGER. There are 48 duplicate-identified databases. Then, the rest of the data are mapped according to inclusion and exclusion criteria. A total of 463 databases were included in the exclusion criteria because the databases were in the form of books and proceedings, did not match the keyword criteria specified in the study, and did not speak English. The remaining 24 databases are articles that are included in the inclusion criteria. In the next stage, the article will be analyzed and deepened using PICOS stats set in exposure to the analysis method.

**Table 3. Mapping of articles included in the inclusion criteria**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Author &amp; Date</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Publication</th>
<th>Journal Accredited</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Christian Moe (2019)</td>
<td>Religious Symbols in Public Schools as Teachable Controversies in Religious Education.&quot;</td>
<td>Center for Educational Policy Studies Journal</td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nasir, M. (2021)</td>
<td>Keeping the Middle Path: Mainstreaming Religious Moderation through Islamic Higher Education Institutions in Indonesia</td>
<td>Indonesian Journal of Islam and Muslim Societies</td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mustakim, Z (2021)</td>
<td>Empowering Students As Agents Of Religious Moderation In Islamic Higher Education Institutions</td>
<td>Jurnal Pendidikan Islam</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wahyu Hidayat, et.al (2022)</td>
<td>&quot;Implementing Science, Social Integration in Islamic Education Learning.&quot;</td>
<td>Jurnal Pendidikan Islam</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Author(s)</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Journal</td>
<td>Issue</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Basri, (2022)</td>
<td>Applying Higher Order Thinking Skill (Hots) To Strengthen Students’ Religious Moderation At Madrasah Aliyah</td>
<td>Jurnal Pendidikan Islam</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Titi, Kadi (2022)</td>
<td>Mainstreaming Islamic Moderations Values in Higher Education: Policy, Implementation, and Challenges</td>
<td>Dinamika Ilmu</td>
<td>Q4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suhadi Winoto (2022)</td>
<td>Improving Curriculum and Lecturers: Challenges to Quality Based-Technology</td>
<td>Journal of Social Studies Education Research</td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nunu Burhamuddin (2022)</td>
<td>Typologies of Religious Moderation in Indonesian Higher Education Institutions.</td>
<td>Journal of Indonesian Islam</td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mohammad Syifa Amin, et al. (2023)</td>
<td>Reason’ of Political and Religious Moderation in the Book of Ghiyath Al-Umam by Al-Juwayni and Its Contemporary Southeast Asian Context.</td>
<td>Cogent Arts Humanities</td>
<td>Q1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Based on the results of mapping articles included in the inclusion criteria, it can be understood that research studies on religious moderation in universities are still a topic that is widely studied by academics and researchers until 2023. This topic attracts attention in academic circles because of its potential in overcoming divisions and increasing interfaith understanding in the campus environment. As social and religious dynamics continue to evolve, efforts to promote inclusive and harmonious approaches to religion within the academic community remain the focus of relevant and valuable research in the context of the times.


Based on the mapping of 24 articles that are included in the inclusion criteria, it can be simplified through the following charts and diagrams:

![Publication Year Chart]

In the publication period 2019 to 2023, the ranking of journals included in the inclusion criteria includes 11 journals with a Q1 rating, 4 journals with a Q2 rating, 3 journals with a Q3 rating, and 6 journals with a Q4 rating. Interestingly, there was a significant increase in the number of Q1 ranking journals, indicating an improvement in the quality and impact of research published in that time frame. This reflects the commitment and achievements of the academic community in making valuable contributions in a variety of disciplines.

In the publication period between 2019 and 2023, the journal has successfully met the inclusion criteria by reaching a total of 24 published articles. The peak achievement occurred in 2022, where this journal managed to produce as many as 11 articles that were
Building Tolerance and Balance: A Systematic Literature Review on ...

Figure 3. Mapping of publication year Articles that fall into the inclusion criteria.

included in the highest ranking throughout this period. The consistent trend of research productivity on religious moderation in high debate is shown by an increase in the number of articles from year to year, starting with 3 articles in 2019, continued with 1 article in 2020, then experiencing a significant increase to 4 articles in 2021, and so on, with 5 articles in 2023. The success of this journal in publishing various articles on religious moderation in higher education over the specified period reflects its strong dedication to research and continued contribution to scientific development.

In 2019, the study of religious moderation in universities focuses a lot on minimizing negative stigma, compassionate attitudes towards oneself and fellow social beings are needed. This is a form of prevention against the growth of radical attitudes. So that the attitude of compassion needs to be nurtured within oneself (Wong et al., 2019). In addition, having a strong religious commitment and a positive heart will foster prosperity in life (Dar and Iqbal, 2019). In the world of education, religious education is needed which refers to the maintenance of religious character in order to have a clear direction and purpose in life (Moe, 2019). This year the research study is more directed at character education which can be the main foundation in having a moderate attitude.

Not much different from the research study in the previous year, in 2020, the research study also focused on religious attitudes which are actually characters that are able to foster an attitude of awareness of the diversity around them (Arli, Septianto, and Chowdhury, 2021). Slightly different from 2019 and 2020, the 2021 research study mapped the characteristics of religious moderation attitudes and values, including: 1) maintain fraternal relationships with others, 2) respect people’s differences, 3) show tolerance and reject fanaticism, and 4) think ahead (Nasir, 2021). In addition, national commitment, tolerance, non-violence, and accommodating to local culture are also included in the characteristics of religious moderation (Syarif, 2021). Having a good communication language that grows from tabayun or careful consideration is also an effort to form a moderate attitude (Sebutu, Adeyemi, and AbdulGaniyy, 2021). Moderation can be de-
veloped through the learning curriculum in educational institutions (Mustakim, Ali, and Kamal, 2021).

The research study in 2022 discusses a lot about the need for moderation in all aspects of social life, including through learning in educational institutions, lecturers and teachers can adopt an interactive teaching system that can influence the mindset of students to be more open and broad-minded (Basri et al., 2022). Moderation will grow from the habit of thinking (Winoto, 2022), an understanding of multiculturalism (Syam and Furwana, 2022), the surrounding environment and the ability to swing towards something before triggers it (Naïm, Aziz, and Teguh, 2022).

Thus, it is necessary to design a curriculum development design in a university that integrates moderation values in order to foster a moderate attitude among students (Kadi, 2022). Good curriculum design must be supported by cooperative implementing resources, educators, education staff and the community in the university environment. They must have a commitment to run the program that has been designed (Nunu and Darul, 2022). Curriculum design that has been designed and implemented properly will affect the culture of tolerance, compassion, respect between religious people who come from various cultures and beliefs (Beggs, 2020; Harmi et al., 2022; Suntana and Tresnawaty, 2022).

There is an interesting study in 2023, this study examines consistency in maintaining religious attitudes in maintaining a moderate character istiqamah and not easily carried away by existing social currents (Hwang et al., 2023). In another study in the same year, it also emphasized the paradigm of society that, the jargon of religious moderation is not just politics and government policies (Widigdo and Awang Pawi, 2023). However, religious moderation has a wider substance and scope than that, namely upholding plural human values in Indonesia (Shahbudin, 2023). These values must be socialized by students, especially intellectuals and academics from among students. That coexistence with a variety of languages, races, cultures, and beliefs is the Grace of God Almighty (Purwanto et al., 2023).

The theoretical discussion in the context of "Building Tolerance and Balance: A Systematic Literature Review (SLR) on Religious Moderation Among University Students" depicts a thorough exploration and understanding of the conceptual framework underpinning this study. Theories such as religious pluralism, interfaith dialogue, and moderation approaches are analyzed to delineate how university students can cultivate attitudes of tolerance and balance in the context of religious diversity. This discussion also delves into the concept of moderation as a middle ground that can lead to respecting belief differences, creating space for dialogue, and promoting shared understanding.

The findings from the literature highlight various aspects influencing religious moderation among students. Previous studies indicate that higher education can be a crucial arena for shaping attitudes of tolerance, with the influence of educational dosage and a supportive campus environment. Factors such as interfaith interactions, understanding of religious values, and participation in cross-faith activities emerge as key elements in fostering religious moderation. However, challenges such as stereotypes, inequality, and the inability to address differences remain concerns. Therefore, the literature supports the need for holistic and continuous educational strategies to assist students in developing religious moderation, creating an inclusive campus environment, and laying the foundation for tolerance and balance amid religious diversity.
3.2. Discussion

3.2.1. Implications of Research on Religious Moderation in Higher Education for Building Tolerance

A research study on Religious Moderation in Higher Education in 2019 highlighted aspects of compassionate attitudes, positive moods, and religious commitments that have significant implications for the well-being of individuals and communities. Internalized compassion in a religious context can create an inclusive and understanding environment within higher education institutions. This has the potential to defuse conflict, foster better cooperation, and promote a positive social climate, all of these factors contribute to mental and emotional well-being.

Similarly, a positive mood, which is associated with a good approach, can have a direct impact on the well-being of life. Furthermore, religious commitment, students who have a balanced religious commitment tend to have a holistic view of life and have a clearer purpose in life. This commitment can provide moral and ethical guidance in dealing with life’s various challenges, helping individuals maintain a balance between academic, social, and spiritual demands.

Research on religious moderation has revealed profound implications for many aspects of people’s lives. A focus on the characteristics of religious moderation, such as maintaining fraternal relations with others, has a positive impact in strengthening social harmony. When individuals are able to establish good relationships with others, an environment of compassion and support is created, reducing the potential for faith-based conflict. Furthermore, appreciating differences, The ability to accept different views and cultures creates a space for productive dialogue and the development of deeper understanding between social beings.

Tolerance and rejection of fanaticism have also emerged as important characteristics in religious moderation research. The implication is the establishment of a peaceful environment, in which religious freedom is respected without threatening security or stability. The ability to think ahead and have good communication is another important impact of religious moderation. Individuals who focus on positive development and building better understanding tend to work together to achieve common goals. It stimulates interfaith collaboration that can advance social, economic, and cultural development in society.

In academic terms, the integration of moderate values into curriculum design allows universities to provide students with a broader view of various religious and cultural perspectives. This helps improve their understanding of the complexity of the world and avoid narrow views that can lead to incomprehension and conflict later on. Therefore, graduates from institutions with this approach are expected to be better able to adapt to global changes and be able to take an active role in promoting peace and tolerance. In addition, the social impact of curriculum design integrated with moderate values can help create an inclusive and welcoming college environment for all.

The study of religious moderation has illustrated that the term religious moderation is not just a matter of rhetoric or government policy, but is a deeper understanding of human values based on religious teachings. Implications include an emphasis on the importance of interfaith dialogue, mutual respect, and cooperation in addressing local and global issues.
Research has also shown that religious moderation plays a crucial role in defusing religious conflicts, reducing radicalization, and promoting peace. Furthermore, a more in-depth exploration of the literature reveals the nuanced dynamics that contribute to religious moderation among university students. The intricacies of identity formation, the role of social media in shaping perceptions, and the impact of global events on religious attitudes emerge as crucial aspects. Studies underscore the importance of fostering critical thinking skills among students to navigate the complexities of religious discourse.

Additionally, the role of faculty and educational institutions in providing platforms for open discussions, promoting cultural exchange programs, and integrating diverse perspectives into the curriculum is emphasized. In essence, a comprehensive understanding of religious moderation necessitates a multifaceted approach that considers individual, social, and institutional factors, acknowledging the interconnected nature of these elements in shaping the attitudes and behaviors of students in higher education.

The literature review on building tolerance and balance through the study of religious moderation in higher education is a topic that highlights the important role of universities in shaping an inclusive and harmonious society. Various studies have shown that universities can serve as social laboratories where students and faculty can learn and practice the values of tolerance, inter-religious dialogue, and a deep understanding of religious differences.

Through an inclusive curriculum, interfaith dialogue activities, and inter-faculty cooperation, universities can play a key role in overcoming interreligious conflicts, as well as promoting balance and harmony amidst an increasingly multicultural and multireligious society. By integrating the study of religious moderation in an academic setting, universities can help create young people who are able to understand, respect, and celebrate religious diversity, and work together to achieve the common goal of building a tolerant and balanced society.

4. Conclusions

In the 2019-2023 period, the trend of religious moderation research in universities emphasizes the importance of moderate character through compassion, positive thinking, having religious commitment, and maintaining brotherhood and minimizing social conflicts. In addition, religious moderation is not only limited to government policy jargon, but religious moderation has a broader substance and scope that emphasizes the growth of human values in coexistence in a plural social environment. Furthermore, the design of educational curricula in higher education needs to be integrated with the values of moderation. The success rate in the realization of curriculum design depends on the commitment of lecturers and the university community in implementing this curriculum.

Research trends on religious moderation in universities during the period 2019-2023 have significant implications. These findings highlight the need for moderate character building among students through the development of compassionate attitudes towards others, a positive mindset, religious commitment, and the ability to maintain brotherhood, while reducing the potential for conflict in society by maintaining good communication in the community. Religious moderation as a substantive value that embodies humanity in social diversity. Therefore, the integration of moderation values can be applied in various lines of community life, one of which is in the design of the college
curriculum. The successful implementation of this curriculum depends on the determination of lecturers and the active participation of the university community in living these values in educational practice.

5. Acknowledgments

Praise and gratitude researchers say the presence of Allah SWT, for everything His blessings, mercy, and graces that have given knowledge, experience, strength, patience, and opportunity to researchers so that able to finish this paper. And also we express our gratitude to the Research and Community Service Institute (LP2M) of Nahdlatul Ulama Sunan Giri University for providing assistance in the form of internal grant funds.

References


Basri, Hasan et al. (2022). “Applying higher order thinking skill (Hots) to strengthen students’ religious moderation at Madrasah Aliyah”. In: Jurnal Pendidikan Islam 8.2, pp. 207–220.


Nasir, Muhammad (2021). “Keeping the middle path mainstreaming religious moderation through Islamic higher education institutions in Indonesia”. In.


