The Effect of Virtual Learning on Medical Student Professionalism: A Systematic Literature Review

Mustika Chasanatusy Syarifah1,2*, Dimas Arendra Aidilfi Akbar3

1 Bioethic and Islamic Medicine Unit, Faculty of Medicine, University Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya, Indonesia
2 Departement of Forensic Medicine and Medicolegal, Faculty of Medicine, University Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya, Indonesia
3 Medical Education Study Program, Faculty of Medicine, University Nahdlatul Ulama Surabaya, Indonesia
*Corresponding author: mustika4n6@unusa.ac.id
DOI: 10.33086/iimj.v4i1.3518

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords: Medical Ethics, Professionalism, Virtual Learning.

Submitted: September 30th 2022
Reviewed: January 16th 2023
Accepted: March 17th 2023

ABSTRACT

Background: Education is an action to develop a potential of human resources accompanied by learning facilities. Education itself has long been attached and developed in human life until now. The number of Covid-19 transmissions in Indonesia is increasing and causing many victims. To break the chain of spreading this virus, the government has formulated a policy that requires students throughout Indonesia to study from home. So that the learning process is free from these conditions, alternative steps are taken, namely through virtual learning.

Objective: The purpose of this study is to compare the literature that has subject matter related to evaluating journals according to the PRISMA and PICO (Problem, Intervention, Comparison, Outcome) methods. Some data were taken from ten articles that were included in the inclusion criteria, including year, keywords, research title, population.

Methods: This systematic literature review is based on an analysis of the literature available in the Pubmed, Elsevier, and Google Scholar databases in English.

Results: From the 10 literatures that have been analyzed, 8 of them state that virtual learning is considered to have the potential to create professional values for medical students.

Conclusion: The COVID-19 pandemic has certainly had an impact on learning activities and could affect the professionalism of medical students, but this can be overcome if the campus is able to provide adequate facilities.

Introduction

Education is an action to develop a potential of human resources accompanied by learning facilities. Education itself has long been attached and developed in human life until now (Mahmudah, 2020). There are two methods that have been broadly applied in human daily life, such as face-to-face education and virtual education.

The main feature of virtual education is the physical isolation between teacher and students. The existence of this physical
separation increases the behaviour of teachers and students that are different from their behaviour in face-to-face education. In distance education, students who want to be successful must have independent learning, because students must act as teachers, especially in motivating themselves to learn. Based on the condition of students receiving face-to-face and distance education, it seems that there is a gap. Students in virtual education must study independently with students who receive face-to-face education.

The number of Covid-19 transmissions in Indonesia is increasing and causing many victims. To break the chain of spreading this virus, the government has formulated a policy that requires students throughout Indonesia to study from home. So that the learning process is free from these conditions, alternative steps are taken, namely through virtual learning.

In the context of virtual learning, independent learners have the ability to learn in conditions that require them to be completely independent from their teachers. There are four dimensions of autonomous learning, namely:

a) Autonomy
b) Self-management
c) Need to learn independently
d) Learner control over learning

As a medical student, we are always requiring to prioritize professionalism in dealing with problems. In the problem of face-to-face learning with distance learning, medical students take on the role of health consultants and provide critic and solutions. Therefore, the different effects on face-to-face learning with virtual learning can increase the sensitivity of medical students.

Methods

In the era of evidence-based medicine or what is known as evidence-based medicine, clinicians must be able to apply the results of peer reviewed scientific research to individual patients in carrying out their duties as doctors. This type of research is a type of systematic literature review.

This systematic literature review is based on an analysis of the literature available in the PubMed, Elsevier, and Google Scholar databases in English. The purpose of this study is to compare the literature that has subject matter related to evaluating journals according to the PRISMA and PICO (Problem, Intervention, Comparison, Outcome) methods. From the search results using the keywords COVID-19, virtual learning, professionalism, medical students found as many as 73 literatures were found.

Result and Discussion

Based on ten selected literatures, all samples used were medical students. Two
articles focused on clinical medical students, while the other focused on preclinical medical students. Various kinds of intervention methods are used to obtain the relationship between virtual learning methods and the professional value of medical students, for example in research that has the same intervention method, namely the study by Sani et al (2020); Hilburg et al (2020); and Afonso et al (2020) which mentions the use of virtual teleconference to fulfil teaching and learning activities for medical students during the Covid-19 pandemic. In a study by Findyartini et al (2020) in this study they used written reflection analysis during the COVID-19 pandemic through the PIF (Professional Identity Formation) lens method. In the research of lancu et al (2020) with the use of telemedicine, the intervention was also used by Afonso et al (2020). In a study by Nivamat et al (2021) mention intervention by providing e-learning modules to medical students during virtual learning. In research by Think et al (2021) conducted a multicentric during the COVID-19 pandemic from 2 February 2021 to 1 April 2021 through social media. In a study by Park et al (2021) using the intervention of identifying research questions, identifying relevant literature, selecting included studies, mapping data, compiling, and summarizing. In a study by Tabatabai (2020), this study uses a virtual reality simulation (VRS) intervention where students will feel like they are in a different environment. It is very possible for medical students to learn from clinical experiences through virtual simulations as they would in real hospital-based experiences. Meanwhile, in the research of Mulcare et al (2020) an intervention in making an 8-hours modular curriculum based on simulation was carried out using the PEARLS question and answer framework with video-based meetings that focused on “website manner”.

Almost all of the comparisons raised in the literature compare learning before COVID-19. However, there are 2 other literatures that compare the student adaptation process and coping strategies in the face of a pandemic; student adaptation process for learning; and the role of medical students during the pandemic, it is mentioned in the literature by Findyartini et al (2020) and Park et al (2021).

From the results of these studies, four literatures show that telemedicine has the potential to increase the value of professionalism, knowledge, communication skills, and technological literacy, including research by lancu et al (2020); Sani et al (2020); Afonso et al (2020); Mulcare et al (2020). For the results of research by Findyartini et al (2020) stated that the students in this study, seemed
to be able to use adaptive coping mechanisms, this is certainly very helpful for students in the formation of professional identities. Then in research by Nivamat et al. (2021) stated that competency-based medical education (CMBE) in an e-learning system supports skills development and focuses on professional training to produce Indian medical graduates who are globally competitive and can meet the growing health needs of the public. And also there are contradictory research results, there are two literatures by Hilburg et al. (2020) and Tabatabai (2020) stated that virtual based medical education has been considered superior to traditional education due to the COVID-19 pandemic so that it can replace face-to-face lectures and small group meetings, but in the other two literatures by Thind et al. (2021) and Park et al. (2021) stated that the development of new education (virtual learning) is still full of challenges and is still considered ineffective and also there are still many students who pay less attention to learning during online lectures.

Figure 1. PRISMA Flowchart

**Article Analysis**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Authors, year of Publication</th>
<th>Population</th>
<th>Intervention</th>
<th>Comparison</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Unmuting medical Students Education: Utilizing Telemedicine During the COVID-19 Pandemic and Beyond</td>
<td>Iancu et al, 2020</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>Use of telemedicine</td>
<td>Before pandemic</td>
<td>Optimal use of telemedicine but not limited to communication, physical examination, professionalism and technological literacy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Exploring medical students’ professional identity formation</td>
<td>Findyartini et al, 2020</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>Written reflection analysis during COVID-19 pandemic using the PIF</td>
<td>Student adaptation processes and coping</td>
<td>The students in this study appeared to be able to use adaptive coping mechanisms. Clinical student appears to be facing greater challenges in</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Authors, year of Publication</td>
<td>Population</td>
<td>Intervention</td>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td>Outcome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>through written reflections during the COVID-19 pandemic</td>
<td>Syarifah, M.C., &amp; Akbar, D. A. A., 2022</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>(Professional Identity Formation) lens methods.</td>
<td>strategies in dealing with the pandemic; their adaptation process to study; and their role as medical students during the pandemic</td>
<td>adapting their learning than preclinical students, due to the temporary cessation of clinical rotation during the pandemic, which has prevented clinical students from having real clinical experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Online Medical Education Challenges and Probable Solutions in the Age of COVID-19</td>
<td>Nirmavat et al, 2021</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>Online medical education with providing e-learning modules</td>
<td>Traditional learning</td>
<td>Competency-Based Medical Education (CBME) in e-learning systems supports skills development and focuses on professional training to produce Indian medical graduates who are globally competitive and able to meet the growing health needs of society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on Caribbean Medical Students: A cross-sectional study</td>
<td>Thind et al, 2021</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>Conducted a multicentric survey during the COVID-19 pandemic from 2 February 2021 to April 2021, via social media sent to second, third- and fourth- year students in Many Caribbean private medical schools</td>
<td>Face-to-face learning method</td>
<td>Online learning is reported to be less time efficient and many students pay less attention to learning during online lectures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Understanding the consequence of COVID-19 on undergraduate medical education: Medical students’ perspective</td>
<td>Sani et al, 2020</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical students</td>
<td>Enforce the quality of medical education such as conducting virtual interprofessional educational sessions to solve clinical sketches and virtual consultation skills with simulated patients</td>
<td>The impact of education medical students before the COVID-19 pandemic</td>
<td>The implementation of virtual consultations with simulated patients can be an alternative step to overcome the problem of medical education during COVID-19. General practitioners throughout the UK have successfully utilized telephone and video consultations to manage patients’ complaints, therefore this modality should be aligned with undergraduate medical education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>A scoping review on adaptation of clinical education for medical students during COVID-19</td>
<td>Park et al, 2021</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>Identification of research questions identifying relevant literature, selecting included studies, mapping data, compiling, summarizing, and reporting results</td>
<td>The process of adapting clinical teaching for medical students in responding to COVID-19 from the beginning of COVID-19 until now</td>
<td>New educational developments caused by the pandemic are still fraught with challenges and there is still a lack of evidence of the effectiveness of virtual education.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Medical education during the coronavirus disease 2019 pandemic: learning from a distance</td>
<td>Hilburg et al, 2020</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>Adaptation of social restrictions in medical education by using video conference software, social media platforms and open access medical journals</td>
<td>Face-to-face learning before COVID-19</td>
<td>The COVID-19 pandemic has necessitated the adoption and implementation of technologies already available in medical education. In many institutions Zoom and similar video conferencing platforms such as BlueJeans and Microsoft Teams have now replaced face-to-face lectures and small group meetings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>“I Have a Cough”: An interactive virtual respiratory</td>
<td>Afonso et al, 2020</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>By providing interactive online modules in three sections for preclinical</td>
<td>Learning methods before COVID-19</td>
<td>This session was conducted for 122 first year medical students. This module was well received by students. Majority felt that it helped improve</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Authors, year of Publication</td>
<td>Population</td>
<td>Intervention</td>
<td>Comparison</td>
<td>Outcome</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>COVID-19 impact and virtual medical education</td>
<td>Tabatabai, 2020</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>Virtual Reality Simulation (VRS) has the unique ability to make students believe they are in a different environment. This allows medical students to learn from real hospital-based experiences</td>
<td>Traditional education methods</td>
<td>Virtual simulation-based medical education has been found to be superior to traditional clinical education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Advanced communication and examination skills in telemedicine: A structured simulation-based course for medical students</td>
<td>Mulcare et al, 2020</td>
<td>Pre-clinical medical student</td>
<td>Creating a simulation-based 8-hour modular curriculum using the PEARLS question and answer framework with video-based meetings focused on a “website manner”</td>
<td>Traditional learning</td>
<td>Out of 98 medical students in their first clinical year participated in 2019. Of the participants, 97% were enthusiastic about the course. 100% they felt simulation was an effective mechanism for delivering educational materials. After participation, 71% believed that telemedicine had the potential to become part of their future practice: 92% feel an improvement in their comfort and ability to conduct video-based patient encounters.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conclusions**

Of the 10 literatures that have been analysed, 8 of them state that virtual learning is considered to have the potential to create professional values for medical students. The COVID-19 pandemic has certainly had an impact on learning activities and could affect the professionalism of medical students, but this can be overcome if the campus is able to provide adequate facilities. This is done so that the virtual learning activities of medical students remain effective and optimal so that the professional value of medical students is maintained.

**Reference**


Park, H., Shim, S., & Lee, Y. (2020). Since January 2020 Elsevier has created a COVID-19 resource centre with free information in English and Mandarin on the novel coronavirus COVID-19. The COVID-19 resource centre is hosted on Elsevier Connect, the company’s public news and information website. Elsevier hereby grants permission to make all its COVID-19-related research that is available on the COVID-19 resource centre - including this research content - immediately available in PubMed Central and other publicly funded repositories, such as the WHO COVID database with rights for unrestricted research re-use and analyses in any form or by any means with acknowledgement of the original source. These permissions are granted for free by Elsevier for as long as the COVID-19 resource centre remains active. *Primary Care Diabetes* A scoping review on adaptations of clinical education for medical students during COVID-19. (January).


